

GMP Dynamic Sourcebook - Appendix J: Choosing by Advantages and Environmentally Preferred Alternative

J.2 Example of Choosing by Advantages Worksheet

	STATUS QUO		ALTERNATIVE 1		ALTERNATIVE 2		ALTERNATIVE 3	
FACTOR 1 Maintain or improve the condition of resources.	ATTRIBUTE: 50 structures preserved (external) 2 rehabilitated (open to public) 4 post-1948 structures removed Cultural landscapes maintained at current level. Security provided at both sites. Natural resources maintained at current level		ATTRIBUTE: 54 structures preserved (external) 15 restored/rehabilitated (open to public.) Potential for additional resource pres. offsite through coop. agreement, partners. Cultural landscape preserved --slight improvement through added preservation efforts more research data --6 comp. landscapes rehabilitated Improved resource security (at least part time) at Oakland--seasonal employees at Doctor's house. Natural resources impacted by development --soils, drainage, compaction, more at Oakland than Magnolia.		ATTRIBUTE: 50 structures preserved (external) 12 structures restored/rehabilitated pen to public) 4 post-1948 structures removed. Cultural I landscape preserved slight to moderate improvement of no action through locating development offsite, low level interpretation. 7 component landscapes restored/rehabilitated Security same as status quo alternative. Natural resources -- protect additional 60-100 acres.		ATTRIBUTE: 54 structures preserved (external) --18 rehabilitated (open to visitors) --3 used to house animals. Cultural landscape preserved -- would receive greater emphasis in the "working plantation" concept, but this benefit diminished by development and high visitor traffic. --9 comp. landscape rehabilitated. Security same as status quo alternative. Natural resources impacted by development --soils, drainage, compaction.	
	ADVANTAGE:	0	ADVANTAGE: -more professional expertise and attention to park and regional resources -many more structures, landscape comp preserved		ADVANTAGE: -many more structures and landscapes comp. preserved (some restored) -minimal site development -double the acreage protected -more protection of regional context	85	ADVANTAGE: -many more structures and landscape components are preserved, used and maintained -more preservation of lifeways	70
FACTOR 2 Provide opportunities for visitors to learn about the history and culture of the Cane River region as represented by the resources of Magnolia and Oakland plantations.	ATTRIBUTE: On site: Opportunities for visitors limited due to limited access to resources/limited park hours. Quiet, uncrowded setting provides contemplative learning environment (esp. for ranger-led groups) Offsite: Opportunities for visitors either not available or limited to primarily non-NPS activities (i.e., chamber, heritage area).		ATTRIBUTE: On site: Opportunities moderately high at visitor center--state of art programs, personal services, exhibits of park artifacts. Opportunities variable in historic core--dependent on projects ongoing & level of visitor interaction with researchers and preservations. Controlled environment at Magnolia. Offsite: Shuttle trip allows heritage area opportunities.		ATTRIBUTE: Onsite: Opportunities to learn moderate to high depending on type of visitor/ type of media used--potentially high quality leaning environment due to setting no new development -dispersment of visitors, low-key interpretation methods. --few opportunities for activity-based learning Offsite Opportunities to learn in Natchitoches and heritage area high --joint v.c. provides state of art programs, personal services, exhibits of park artifacts; --shuttle system offers interpretation en route to park; --partnerships w/heritage area, others, result in other interp/education programs, etc.		ATTRIBUTE: Onsite: Opportunities to learn moderate to high --wide variety of experiences/ opportunities available depicting a working plantation and lifeways. --few opportunities for contemplative for experiences due to high levels of activity and substantial development within historic landscape. Offsite: Opportunities to learn moderate to low--joint contact facility provides basic orientation to park and area.	

	STATUS QUO		ALTERNATIVE 1		ALTERNATIVE 2		ALTERNATIVE 3	
	ADVANTAGE:	0	ADVANTAGE: -unique experiential opportunity to interpret a preservation laboratory -much more extensive vis. opportunities at vc & onsite- whole range of techniques -more exposure to reg. themes		ADVANTAGE: -much more extensive visitor exposure to regional opportunities and themes. -greater diversity of visitor opportunities throughout region -facilitates opportunity for visitor self-educate -acquisition provides additional visitor experiences.	100	ADVANTAGE: -facilitates participative learning activities onsite -much more extensive visitor opportunities onsite to experience and understand plantation lifeways - more extensive visitor exposure to regional opportunities and themes.	80
FACTOR 3 Provide visitor access, circulation, and services that enhance visitor enjoyment of the park.	ATTRIBUTE: Onsite: Access to site and structures minimal. Very limited services. Offsite: No visitor services		ATTRIBUTE: Onsite: High level of visitor services --convenient parking at Oakland, v.c. programs and services, trails to key resources, some structures accessible, Oakland-Magnolia shuttle Offsite Potential shuttle access to other HA sites		ATTRIBUTE: Onsite: Low level of services--little to no parking, basic facilities, very limited personal services. Offsite: High level of visitor services--convenient parking, v.c. programs and services, shuttle service w/interpretive services (heritage area/park overview).		ATTRIBUTE: Onsite: Moderately high level of visitor services--convenient parking, orientation and restrooms, high level of personal services--programs and demos Offsite: Moderate to low level of services--convenient parking, basic information and restrooms, low level of personal services	
	ADVANTAGE:	0	ADVANTAGE: -extensive, complete visitor services onsite -much more access to park resources		ADVANTAGE: -very extensive, complete visitor services offsite -more and direct access to onsite resources -greater access to regional resources	40	ADVANTAGE: -more convenient access to the park -much more direct access to park resources -more access to regional resources -extensive personal services onsite	50
FACTOR 4 Establish operational efficiency and sustainability.	ATTRIBUTE: Moderate efficiency for initial low visitation--small staff concentrated in one area, allowing good communication among staff and with visitors, proximity to resource. Efficiency will diminish as program/visitation grows.		ATTRIBUTE: Moderately high efficiency for operations-- admin. and interp. staff combined, good communication, high access to majority of visitors and resources (70%). Controlled access to Magnolia Onsite maintenance promotes good communication, and potentially efficiency. Reuse structures that would have to be maintained anyway.		ATTRIBUTE: Moderate to low efficiency for operations--admin and some interp staff combined in town (high access to many visitors and community), other interp staff at units, maintenance elsewhere. Operations fractured between 4 areas (5 incl Curation storage). Best efficiency for communication/business with area partners.		ATTRIBUTE: High operational efficiency--majority of staff combined at Oakland, allowing good communication, efficient use of space & parking, proximity to majority of visitors and resources (70%). Onsite collections management.	
	ADVANTAGE: - Consolidated staff at Oakland	30	ADVANTAGE: -improved capability for preservation maintenance -consolidated staff at Oakland		ADVANTAGE:	0	ADVANTAGE: -staff at only 2 locations	20

	STATUS QUO		ALTERNATIVE 1		ALTERNATIVE 2		ALTERNATIVE 3	
FACTOR 5 Assist in educational and preservation activities in support of Cane River cultural heritage.	ATTRIBUTE: Onsite: Minimal partnership opportunities pursued in education/preservation assistance Offsite: Minimal partnership opportunities pursued in education/preservation assistance.		ATTRIBUTE: Onsite: Moderate partnership opportunities pursued in education/preservation assistance Offsite: Minimal partnership opportunities pursued in education/preservation assistance.		ATTRIBUTE: Onsite: Minimal partnership opportunities pursued in education/preservation assistance Offsite: High level of partnership opportunities in educational and preservation assistance including technical assistance		ATTRIBUTE: Onsite: Moderate level of partnership opportunities pursued in educational/preservation assistance. Offsite: Minimal partnership opportunities pursued in education/preservation assistance	
	ADVANTAGE:	0	ADVANTAGE: -provide outreach by example, research resource, and focus for prof. preservation programs		ADVANTAGE: -extensive, multiple partnership activities including technical assistance	60	ADVANTAGE: -provide focus for lifeways preservation, education and school programs	40
TOTAL IMPORTANCE OF THE ADVANTAGES		30				285		260