

Contents

CHAPTER 1: PURPOSE AND NEED FOR ACTION.....	1
Introduction	1
Purpose and Need for Action.....	1
Objectives	2
Visitor Experience and Safety	2
Law Enforcement / Compliance with Dog Rules, and Park Operations.....	2
Park Operations.....	2
Natural Resources	2
Cultural Resources	2
Education	2
Background of Dog Management at Golden Gate National Recreation Area.....	3
Golden Gate Nation Recreation Area Lands Included in the Plan / Environmental Impact Statement	3
Land Use Prior to Park Acquisition	4
Golden Gate National Recreation Area Citizens’ Advisory Commission and the 1979 Pet Policy	4
Increase in Use of the Park for Dog Walking and Other Recreational Uses	5
Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking.....	8
Current Dog Management Issues and Impact Topics.....	12
Expectations and Views of Dog Walkers and Other Visitors	13
Impacts of Dogs on Natural and Cultural Resources in the Park.....	13
Visitor Use and Experience	18
Employee, Visitor, and Dog Health and Safety	19
Needs of Urban Area Residents	20
Public Confusion over National Park Service-Wide Dog Regulation, Golden Gate National Recreation Area-Specific Rules, National Park Service Mission and Policies	21
Issues and Impact Topics Dismissed from Analysis	21
Energy Requirements and Conservation Potential.....	21
Natural or Depletable Resource Requirements and Conservation Potential.....	22
Urban Quality and Design of the Built Environment	22
Floodplains.....	22
Prime and Unique Agricultural Lands	22
Wild and Scenic Rivers.....	23
Indian Trust Resources and Sacred Sites	23
Socioeconomics	23
Summary of Background Conditions and Review of Literature	25
Dog Management Policies from Other Agencies	25
Other National Park Units.....	25
Other San Francisco Bay Area Agencies.....	25
Other Municipalities	27

Dogs and Wildlife	28
Health and Safety	29
Dogs and Visitor Experience	30
Environmental Justice	31
Scoping Process and Public Participation	32
Public Involvement with the National Environmental Policy Act Process.....	32
Goals of the Public Involvement Process	32
Public Involvement in the Environmental Impact Statement Process	33
Related Laws, Regulations, and Policies.....	34
National Park Service Organic Act and Management Policies.....	34
Golden Gate National Recreation Area Laws, Policies, and Plans.....	36
Other Federal Regulations, Laws, and Policies	38
National Environmental Policy Act, 1969, as Amended	38
National Parks Omnibus Management Act of 1998	38
Endangered Species Act of 1973, as Amended	39
Migratory Bird Treaty Act and Executive Order 13186	39
The National Historic Preservation Act of 1966, as Amended	39
Coastal Zone Management Act.....	39
Code of Federal Regulations, Title 36, Volume 1	39
National Park Service Director’s Orders	41
State and Local Laws, Regulations, and Policies	41
CHAPTER 2: ALTERNATIVES	43
Introduction	43
Study Area Definition	43
Alternatives Development Process	45
Range of Alternatives	45
Alternative A: No Action (Continuation of Existing Management)	58
Current Regulations and Policies	58
Current Costs for Dog Management.....	58
Status of Current Dog Walking Activities Under Alternative A	58
Elements Common to Action Alternatives	61
Areas Open to Dog Walking	62
Permits for more than Three Dogs – Commercial and Individual Dog Walkers	63
Outreach and Education	63
Partnerships	63
Compliance-Based Management Strategy	63
Unforeseeable Changes to Plan / Environmental Impact Statement Implementation	67
Alternative B: NPS Leash Regulation (36 CFR 2.15 and Golden Gate National Recreation Area Compendium)	68
New Lands	69
Cost of Implementation	69

Dog Walking Activities Proposed Under Alternative B	69
Alternative C: Emphasis on Multiple Use – Balanced by County	74
New Lands	74
Cost of Implementation	75
Dog Walking Activities Proposed Under Alternative C	75
Alternative D: Most Protective of Resources and Visitor Safety	79
New Lands	79
Cost of Implementation	80
Dog Walking Activities Proposed Under Alternative D	80
Alternative E: Most Dog Walking Access / Most Management Intensive	85
New Lands	85
Cost of Implementation	85
Dog Walking Activities Proposed Under Alternative E	85
How the Alternatives Meet the Objectives	91
Alternative Elements Eliminated from Further Consideration	92
Summary—Consistency with Sections 101(B) and 102(1) of NEPA	94
Environmentally Preferable Alternative	99
National Park Service Preferred Alternative	103
CHAPTER 3: AFFECTED ENVIRONMENT	221
Introduction	221
General Project Setting.....	221
Soils and Geology	222
Geologic Setting	222
Overview of Soils	222
Rare Soils at Golden Gate National Recreation Area.....	225
Alteration of Park Soils.....	225
Water Quality	226
Overview of Water Quality in Golden Gate National Recreation Area.....	226
Marine Resources	228
Dogs at Golden Gate National Recreation Area	228
Vegetation and Wildlife	228
Coastal Communities	230
Coastal Scrub and Chaparral.....	235
Grasslands	237
Wetlands and Open Water	239
Native Hardwood Forest	240
Riparian Forests and Streams.....	241
Douglas-fir and Coast Redwood.....	242
Monterey Cypress	243
Invasive Plant Species.....	243
Special-status Species.....	244

Federally and State-listed Threatened and Endangered Species and Candidate Species.....	246
Endangered, Threatened, and Candidate Species: Wildlife	247
Threatened, Endangered, and Candidate Species: Plants.....	256
Cultural Resources	258
Area of Potential Effects.....	258
Cultural Resource Context.....	259
Cultural Resource Types.....	260
Climate Change	265
Visitor Use and Experience	266
Park Visitation Information	266
Visitor Experience	279
Aesthetics.....	281
Soundscapes.....	281
Environmental Justice.....	281
Park Operations	282
Budget and Employees	282
Community Relations and Public Education	282
Law Enforcement.....	282
Administration and Planning	284
Natural Resource Management.....	284
Cultural Resource Management.....	284
Maintenance.....	285
Human Health and Safety.....	285
Exposure to Pathogens from Dogs.....	286
Visitors.....	286
Staff.....	286
CHAPTER 4: ENVIRONMENTAL CONSEQUENCES	289
Introduction	289
General Methodology for Analyzing Impacts	289
Compliance-Based Management Strategy	290
Cumulative Impact Scenario	290
Soils and Geology	291
Guiding Policies and Regulations	291
Study Area	291
Duration of impact	291
Assessment Methodology	291
Impact Thresholds.....	292
Potential Soil Impacts Common to All Alternatives	292
Cumulative Impacts to Soils that are Common to All Alternatives	293
Compliance-Based Management Strategy	295
Marin County Sites	296

San Francisco County Sites	353
San Mateo County Sites	425
Water Quality	459
Guiding Policies and Regulations	459
Study Area	459
Duration of Impact	460
Assessment Methodology	460
Impact Thresholds	460
Water Quality Impacts Common to All Alternatives	461
Compliance-Based Management Strategy	464
Marin County Sites	464
San Francisco County Sites	496
San Mateo County Sites	523
Vegetation	537
Guiding Policies and Regulations	537
Study Area	538
Duration of Impact	538
Assessment Methodology	539
Impact Thresholds	539
Common to All Alternatives	540
Cumulative Impacts Common to All Alternatives	541
Compliance-Based Management Strategy	543
Coastal Communities	543
Marin County Sites	544
San Francisco County Sites	567
Coastal Scrub, Chaparral, and Grassland Communities	619
Marin County Sites	619
San Francisco County Sites	651
San Mateo County Sites	665
Wetlands and Aquatic Habitats	698
Marin County Sites	699
San Francisco County Sites	719
San Mateo County Sites	726
Native Hardwood Forests and Douglas-fir/Coast Redwoods	740
Riparian Forest and Stream Corridors	767
Marin County Sites	767
Wildlife	791
Guiding Policies and Regulations	791
Study Area	793
Duration of Impact	794
Assessment Methodology	794

Impact Thresholds	794
Impacts Common to All Alternatives	795
Cumulative Impacts on Wildlife that are Common to All Alternatives	801
Compliance-Based Management Strategy	802
Wildlife in Coastal Communities	803
Marin County Sites	803
San Francisco County Sites	831
San Mateo Sites	881
Wildlife in Coastal Scrub, Chaparral, and Grassland Communities	895
Marin County Sites	896
San Francisco County Sites	937
San Mateo County Sites	955
Wildlife in Wetlands and Aquatic Communities	994
Marin County Sites	995
San Francisco County Sites	1016
San Mateo County Sites	1023
Wildlife in the Native Hardwood Forest and Douglas-fir/Coast Redwood Community	1037
Marin County Sites	1037
Wildlife in Riparian Forest and Stream Corridors	1068
Marin County Sites	1069
Wildlife in Other Coniferous Communities	1094
Special-Status Species	1109
Guiding Policies and Regulations	1109
Study Area	1112
Duration of Impact	1112
Assessment Methodology	1112
Impact Thresholds	1113
Impacts Common to All Alternatives	1115
Compliance-Based Management Strategy	1116
Federally and State-Listed Wildlife Species	1117
San Bruno Elfin Butterfly (Federally Endangered)	1117
Mission Blue Butterfly (Federally Endangered)	1123
Tidewater Goby (Federally Endangered)	1165
Coho Salmon (Federally and State Endangered)	1172
Steelhead Trout (Federally Threatened)	1179
California Red-legged Frog (Federally Threatened)	1191
San Francisco Garter Snake (Federally and State Endangered)	1219
Western Snowy Plover (Federally Threatened)	1240
Bank Swallow (State Threatened)	1263
Northern Spotted Owl (Federally Threatened)	1270
Guadalupe Fur Seal (Federally and State Threatened)	1282

Steller Sea Lion (Federally Threatened)	1282
Federally and State-listed Plant Species	1291
San Francisco Lessingia (Federally and State Endangered)	1291
Presidio (Raven's) Manzanita (Federally and State Endangered)	1312
Marin Dwarf-flax (Federally and State Threatened)	1320
California Seablite (Federally Endangered)	1328
Hickman's Potentilla (Federally Endangered and State Endangered)	1333
Cultural Resources	1355
Guiding Regulations and Policies	1355
Study Area	1355
Assessment Methodology	1356
Thresholds	1356
Compliance-Based Management Strategy	1359
Impacts Analysis	1359
Alternative A: No Action	1359
Elements Common to All Action Alternatives (B through E)	1366
Alternative B: NPS Leash Regulation	1368
Alternative C: Emphasis on Multiple Use	1371
Alternative D: Most Protective of Resources and Visitor Safety	1374
Alternative E: Most Dog Walking Access/Most Management Intensive	1377
Preferred Alternative	1381
Visitor Use and Experience	1401
Guiding Policies and Regulations	1401
Study Area	1401
Duration of Impact	1401
Assessment Methodology	1402
Impact Thresholds	1402
Impacts Common to All Alternatives	1404
Compliance-Based Management Strategy	1408
Impact Analysis for All Alternatives	1409
Marin County Sites	1409
San Francisco County Sites	1463
San Mateo County Sites	1531
Park Operations	1563
Guiding Policies and Regulations	1563
Study Area	1563
Duration of Impact	1563
Assessment Methodology	1563
Impact Thresholds	1565
Compliance-Based Management Strategy	1566
Alternative A: No-action Alternative	1566

Common to All Action Alternatives (B, C, D, and E)	1568
Human Health and Safety	1591
Guiding Policies and Regulations	1591
Study Area	1591
Duration of Impact	1592
Assessment Methodology	1592
Impact Thresholds	1592
Common to All Alternatives	1593
Compliance-Based Management Strategy	1597
Marin County Sites	1598
San Francisco County Sites	1641
San Mateo County Sites	1698
Sustainability and Long Term Management	1725
Compliance-Based Management Strategy	1725
Short-Term Uses versus Long-Term Enhancement of Resources	1725
Adverse Impacts that Could Not Be Avoided	1728
Irreversible/Irretrievable Commitments of Resources	1730
CHAPTER 5: CONSULTATION AND COORDINATION	1731
The Scoping Process	1731
Public Scoping	1731
Internal Scoping	1733
Agency and Stakeholder Consultation	1733
Cooperating Agency	1733
Endangered Species Act Section 7 Consultation	1734
Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act Consultation	1736
List of Primary Preparers	1738
List of Recipients and Reviewers	1740
Elected Officials and committees	1740
Federal Agencies	1740
California State Agencies	1741
Regional and Local Agencies	1741
Cities	1741
Organizations	1742
REFERENCES	1743
GLOSSARY	1771
INDEX	1801

Maps

Map 1	Vicinity
Map 2-A	Stinson Beach – Alternative A
Map 2-B	Stinson Beach – Alternative B
Map 2-C	Stinson Beach – Alternative C
Map 2-D	Stinson Beach – Alternative D
Map 2-E	Stinson Beach – Alternative E
Map 2-P	Preferred Alternative: Stinson Beach
Map 3-A	Homestead Valley – Alternative A
Map 3-B	Homestead Valley – Alternative B
Map 3-C	Homestead Valley – Alternative C
Map 3-D	Homestead Valley – Alternative D
Map 3-E	Homestead Valley – Alternative E
Map 3-P	Preferred Alternative: Homestead Valley
Map 4-A	Oakwood Valley / Alta Trail – Alternative A
Map 4-B	Oakwood Valley / Alta Trail – Alternative B
Map 4-C	Oakwood Valley / Alta Trail – Alternative C
Map 4-D	Oakwood Valley / Alta Trail – Alternative D
Map 4-E	Oakwood Valley / Alta Trail – Alternative E
Map 4-P	Preferred Alternative: Oakwood Valley / Alta Trail
Map 5-A	Muir Beach – Alternative A
Map 5-B	Muir Beach – Alternative B
Map 5-C	Muir Beach – Alternative C
Map 5-D	Muir Beach – Alternative D
Map 5-E	Muir Beach – Alternative E
Map 5-P	Preferred Alternative: Muir Beach
Map 6-A	Rodeo Beach – Alternative A
Map 6-B	Rodeo Beach – Alternative B
Map 6-C	Rodeo Beach – Alternative C
Map 6-D	Rodeo Beach – Alternative D
Map 6-E	Rodeo Beach – Alternative E
Map 6-P	Preferred Alternative: Rodeo Beach
Map 7-A	Marin Headlands Trails – Alternative A
Map 7-B	Marin Headlands Trails – Alternative B

Map 7-C	Marin Headlands Trails – Alternative C
Map 7-D	Marin Headlands Trails – Alternative D
Map 7-E	Marin Headlands Trails – Alternative E
Map 7-P	Preferred Alternative: Marin Headlands Trails
Map 8-A	Fort Baker – Alternative A
Map 8-B	Fort Baker – Alternative B
Map 8-C	Fort Baker – Alternative C
Map 8-D	Fort Baker – Alternative D
Map 8-E	Fort Baker – Alternative E
Map 8-P	Preferred Alternative: Fort Baker
Map 9-A	Upper Fort Mason – Alternative A
Map 9-B	Upper Fort Mason – Alternative B
Map 9-C	Upper Fort Mason – Alternative C
Map 9-D	Upper Fort Mason – Alternative D
Map 9-E	Upper Fort Mason – Alternative E
Map 9-P	Preferred Alternative: Upper Fort Mason
Map 10-A	Crissy Field – Alternative A
Map 10-B	Crissy Field – Alternative B
Map 10-C	Crissy Field – Alternative C
Map 10-D	Crissy Field – Alternative D
Map 10-E	Crissy Field – Alternative E
Map 10-P	Preferred Alternative: Crissy Field
Map 11-A	Fort Point – Alternative A
Map 11-B	Fort Point – Alternative B
Map 11-C	Fort Point – Alternative C
Map 11-D	Fort Point – Alternative D
Map 11-E	Fort Point – Alternative E
Map 11-P	Preferred Alternative: Fort Point
Map 12-A	Baker Beach – Alternative A
Map 12-B	Baker Beach – Alternative B
Map 12-C	Baker Beach – Alternative C
Map 12-D	Baker Beach – Alternative D
Map 12-E	Baker Beach – Alternative E
Map 12-P	Preferred Alternative: Baker Beach
Map 13-A	Lands End / Fort Miley – Alternative A

Map 13-B	Lands End / Fort Miley – Alternative B
Map 13-C	Lands End / Fort Miley – Alternative C
Map 13-D	Lands End / Fort Miley – Alternative D
Map 13-E	Lands End / Fort Miley – Alternative E
Map 13-P	Preferred Alternative: Lands End / Fort Miley
Map 14-A	Sutro Heights Park – Alternative A
Map 14-B	Sutro Heights Park – Alternative B
Map 14-C	Sutro Heights Park – Alternative C
Map 14-D	Sutro Heights Park – Alternative D
Map 14-E	Sutro Heights Park – Alternative E
Map 14-P	Preferred Alternative: Sutro Heights Park
Map 15-A	Ocean Beach – Alternative A
Map 15-B	Ocean Beach – Alternative B
Map 15-C	Ocean Beach – Alternative C
Map 15-D	Ocean Beach – Alternative D
Map 15-E	Ocean Beach – Alternative E
Map 15-P	Preferred Alternative: Ocean Beach
Map 16-A	Fort Funston – Alternative A
Map 16-B	Fort Funston – Alternative B
Map 16-C	Fort Funston – Alternative C
Map 16-D	Fort Funston – Alternative D
Map 16-E	Fort Funston – Alternative E
Map 16-P	Preferred Alternative: Fort Funston
Map 17-A	Mori Point – Alternative A
Map 17-B	Mori Point – Alternative B
Map 17-C	Mori Point – Alternative C
Map 17-D	Mori Point – Alternative D
Map 17-E	Mori Point – Alternative E
Map 17-P	Preferred Alternative: Mori Point
Map 18-A	Milagra Ridge – Alternative A
Map 18-B	Milagra Ridge – Alternative B
Map 18-C	Milagra Ridge – Alternative C
Map 18-D	Milagra Ridge – Alternative D
Map 18-E	Milagra Ridge – Alternative E
Map 18-P	Preferred Alternative: Milagra Ridge

Map 19-A	Cattle Hill / Sweeney Ridge – Alternative A
Map 19-B	Cattle Hill / Sweeney Ridge – Alternative B
Map 19-C	Cattle Hill / Sweeney Ridge – Alternative C
Map 19-D	Cattle Hill / Sweeney Ridge – Alternative D
Map 19-E	Cattle Hill / Sweeney Ridge – Alternative E
Map 19-P	Preferred Alternative: Cattle Hill
Map 20-A	Pedro Point – Alternative A
Map 20-B	Pedro Point – Alternative B
Map 20-C	Pedro Point – Alternative C
Map 20-D	Pedro Point – Alternative D
Map 20-E	Pedro Point – Alternative E
Map 20-P	Preferred Alternative: Pedro Point
Map 21	Vegetation Communities in Marin County within Golden Gate National Recreation Area
Map 22	Vegetation Communities in San Francisco County within Golden Gate National Recreation Area
Map 23	Vegetation Communities in San Mateo County within Golden Gate National Recreation Area
Map 24	Marin County Sites: Golden Gate National Recreation Area
Map 25	San Francisco County Sites: Golden Gate National Recreation Area
Map 26	City, County, and State Parks with Dog Use Areas: Marin County, CA
Map 27	City, County, and State Parks with Dog Use Areas: San Francisco and San Mateo Counties, CA

Figures

Figure 1. Commonly Observed Shorebird Species at GGNRA Beaches, 1993–2009.....	233
Figure 2. Average Shorebird Density by Month and Beach at GGNRA, 1993–2009	233
Figure 3. Battery East, with Erosion of Earthworks Evident.....	261
Figure 4. Example of Temporary Field Fortification Which Supported Nearby Fortified Batteries	263
Figure 5. Recorded Annual Visitation to Golden Gate National Recreation Area, 1973 to 2009	267
Figure 6. Forecasted Annual Visitation to Golden Gate National Recreation Area	269
Figure 7. Example of Fencing Design to be Installed at Batteries Davis and East.....	1367

Tables

Table 1. Current Dog Management Conditions	6
Table 2. Golden Gate National Recreation Area Park Sites Considered for Dog Management in the Alternatives	44
Table 3. Summary of Alternative Elements by County, North to South	48
Table 4. Federal Regulations Applicable to Dog Management	65
Table 5. Environmental Impact Summary by Alternative	109
Table 6. Recorded Incidents Involving Dogs in 2007 and 2008	230
Table 7. Marine Mammal Center Total Number of Individual Live Animal Reports for Stranding in GGNRA, 2000 through 2005 and 2007 through 2009	235
Table 8. Federally and State-listed Species Considered in This Plan/EIS	246
Table 9. Summary of Visitor Use and Pet-related Citations, Warnings, and Reports Taken at GGNRA	271
Table 10. Total Maintenance and Labor Hours and Costs Associated with Trash Removal from October 2006 to April 2008	285
Table 11. Current (Alternative A) Estimated Personnel Costs	1567
Table 12. Estimated Personnel Costs (Alternatives B, C, D, and E)	1569
Table 13. Estimated Personnel Costs for the New Lands Preferred Alternative	1589
Table 14. Federally and State-listed Species Considered in Detail in the Dog Management Plan/EIS	1735

Appendices

Appendix A: 1979 GGNRA Advisory Commission Pet Policy

Appendix B: GGNRA Compendium

Appendix C: GGNRA Dog Management Plan/EIS Determination of Non-Impairment

Appendix D: Sections of Titles 36 and 50 of the Code of Federal Regulations

Appendix E: Guidelines for ROLAs

Appendix F: Special Use Permit

Appendix G: Law Enforcement Data

Appendix H: Special Status Species

Appendix I: Cultural Resources

Appendix J: Adjacent Dog Use Areas

Appendix K: Past, Present, and Future Projects and Actions Considered for the Cumulative Impacts Analysis

Appendix L: Agency Consultation