## **Washington Monument Screening Facility – Draft Assessment of Adverse Effects Matrix**

|   | Option A  | Option B   | Option C  | Option D  | Option E  | Option F  |
|---|---|--|---|---|---|---|
| Chausatan                                       |   |  |   |   |   |   |
| Character-<br>Defining<br>Landscape<br>Features | <ul> <li>Vegetation – Removes portion of lawn east of plaza, altering its relationship to the Monument.</li> <li>Topography – Excavates portion of the mound, altering its relationship to the lawn and the Monument.</li> <li>Spatial organization – Ramps and safety barriers separate Monument and plaza from surrounding landscape and alter the simplicity of the existing relationships between these features. In plan, the ramps alter the symmetry of the Monument and plaza.</li> <li>Circulation – Closes traditional entrance at base of Monument, altering visitor experience. Visitors enter below grade and at some distance from face of Monument. Ends access to contributing features of the elevator lobby.</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Vegetation – Removes portion of lawn east of plaza, altering its relationship to the Monument.</li> <li>Topography – Excavates and regrades a portion of the mound, altering its relationship to the lawn and the Monument.</li> <li>Spatial organization – Excavation and approach walk alter the simplicity of existing relationships between the Monument, plaza, and surrounding landscape to the east, including Monument Lodge. In plan, the approach walk alters the symmetry of the Monument and plaza.</li> <li>Circulation – Closes traditional entrance at base of Monument, altering visitor experience. Visitors enter below grade and at some distance from face of Monument. Distance is greater in Option B than in other options. Ends access to contributing features of elevator lobby.</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Vegetation – Removes portions of lawn north and south of plaza, altering the lawn's relationship to the Monument. Area removed is less than Options A and B.</li> <li>Topography – Excavates portion of mound, slightly altering its relationship to the lawn and the Monument.</li> <li>Spatial organization – Ramps and safety barriers alter the simplicity of existing relationships between Monument, plaza, and surrounding landscape to the north and south.</li> <li>Circulation – Closes traditional entrance at base of Monument, altering visitor experience. Visitors enter below grade and at some distance from face of Monument. Ends access to contributing features of elevator lobby.</li> <li>Small-scale features – Excavation on south side of plaza would expose the elevation obelisk, which has remained within a well since the mound was created, circa 1890.</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Vegetation – Removes portions of lawn east and west of plaza, slightly altering lawn's relationship to the Monument. Area removed is less than Options A and B.</li> <li>Topography – Excavates portion of mound, altering its relationship to the lawn and the Monument. Amount excavated is less than in Options A and B.</li> <li>Spatial organization – Ramps and safety barriers separate Monument and plaza from surrounding landscape to the east and west and alter the simplicity of the existing relationships between these features.</li> <li>Circulation – Closes traditional entrance at base of Monument. Visitors enter below grade and at some distance from face of Monument. Ends access to contributing features of elevator lobby.</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Spatial organization – Entrance pavilion alters the simplicity of the existing relationships between Monument, plaza, and surrounding landscape. In plan, the pavilion alters the symmetry of the Monument and plaza.</li> <li>Circulation – Although visitors enter the Monument in the traditional location, the entrance pavilion obscures views of the original doorway from the plaza.</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Spatial organization – Ramps and safety barriers alter the simplicity of the existing relationship between Monument, plaza, and surrounding landscape to the east and south. This effect is less than in options A-D.</li> <li>Circulation – Closes traditional entrance at base of Monument. Visitors enter below grade. Although visitors no longer enter at the face of the monument, the distance of the new entrance from the traditional entrance is less than in options A-D. Ends access to contributing features of elevator lobby. Limits visitor access to a portion of the plaza.</li> </ul> |
| Buildings and<br>Structures                     | <ul> <li>Removes original material from both<br/>the Mills-era and Casey-era<br/>foundations.</li> <li>Unloading required for maintaining<br/>Monument stability may affect<br/>below-grade mechanical area.</li> </ul>   | <ul> <li>Removes original material from both<br/>the Mills-era and Casey-era<br/>foundations.</li> <li>Unloading required for maintaining<br/>Monument stability may affect<br/>below-grade mechanical area.</li> </ul>  |   | <ul> <li>Removes original material from both the Mills-era and Casey-era foundations. The effect is greater in Option D than in other options because there is excavation on both sides of the Monument.</li> <li>Alters or removes below-grade mechanical area.</li> </ul>   | <ul> <li>Inserts pavilion in the historically open space of the plaza.</li> <li>Affects stone where pavilion is attached to Monument.</li> </ul>  | <ul> <li>Removes original material from<br/>both the Mills-era and Casey-<br/>era foundations.</li> <li>Unloading required for<br/>maintaining Monument<br/>stability may affect below-<br/>grade mechanical area.</li> </ul>   |

DRAFT Assessment of Adverse Effects Matrix

September 13, 2012

## **Washington Monument Screening Facility – Draft Assessment of Adverse Effects Matrix**

|                  | Option A  | Option B  | Option C   | Option D   | Option E   | Option F   |
|------------------|---|---|--|--|--|--|
| Vious and        | Retaining walls, ramps, safety  | Retaining walls, safety barrier,  | <ul> <li>Retaining walls and safety</li> </ul>   |  | <ul> <li>Pavilion obscures views of original</li> </ul>  | Safety barriers alter views of   |
| Views and Vistas | <ul> <li>Retaining walls, ramps, safety barrier, and changes to mound alter views of Monument from east side of Monument grounds.</li> <li>Retaining walls, ramps, safety barrier, and changes to mound alter views of Monument from the Mall, generally in the area between 12<sup>th</sup> and 14<sup>th</sup> streets.</li> <li>Retaining walls, ramps, safety barrier, and changes to mound alter views of Monument from north and south sides of Monument Grounds, including Constitution and Independence avenues.</li> <li>Retaining walls, ramps, safety barrier, and changes to mound alter aerial views of Monument.</li> <li>Safety barrier, ramps, and changes to mound alter panoramic views from the Monument and plaza to the east and, to a lesser extent, to the north and south.</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Retaining walls, safety barrier, changes to mound, and approach walk alter views of Monument from east side of Monument grounds.</li> <li>Retaining wall, safety barrier, changes to mound, and approach walk alter views of Monument from the Mall, generally in the area between 12<sup>th</sup> and 14<sup>th</sup> streets.</li> <li>Retaining wall, safety barrier, and changes to mound alter views of Monument from north and south sides of Monument Grounds, including Constitution and Independence avenues.</li> <li>Retaining wall, safety barrier, changes to mound, and approach walk alter aerial views of Monument.</li> <li>Safety barrier and approach walk alter panoramic views from the Monument and plaza to the east.</li> <li>Retaining wall, safety barrier, changes to mound, and approach walk alter views from top of Monument.</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Retaining walls and safety barriers alter views of Monument from east and west sides of Monument grounds. Effects are less on views from east than in Options A, B, D, and E.</li> <li>Retaining walls and safety barriers alter views of Monument from north and south sides of Monument Grounds, including Constitution and Independence avenues.</li> <li>Retaining wall, safety barriers, and excavation alter aerial views of Monument.</li> <li>Safety barriers, ramps, and excavation alter panoramic views from the Monument and plaza to the north and south.</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Retaining walls, ramps, safety barriers, and changes to mound alter views of Monument from east and west sides of Monument grounds. Effects are less on the east than in Options A and B, but greater on the west.</li> <li>Retaining walls, ramps, safety barriers, and changes to mound alter views of Monument from north and south sides of Monument Grounds, including Constitution and Independence avenues.</li> <li>Retaining wall, safety barriers, and excavation alter aerial views of Monument.</li> <li>Safety barriers, ramps, and excavation alter aerial views of Monument.</li> <li>Safety barriers and ramps alter panoramic views from the Monument and plaza to the east and west.</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>entrance to Monument.</li> <li>Pavilion alters views of Monument from east side of Monument grounds.</li> <li>Pavilion alters views of Monument from the Mall, generally in the area between 12<sup>th</sup> and 14<sup>th</sup> streets. Effects are greater in</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Safety barriers after views of Monument from south, east, and west side of Monument Grounds.</li> <li>Safety barriers and ramp alter aerial views of Monument. Effect is less in Option F than in other options because the ramp occupies a smaller area than in other options.</li> <li>Safety barriers alter panoramic views from the Monument and plaza to the south.</li> </ul> |
| Archeology       | Possible effects to potential archeological resources. Effects would depend on depth of excavation. (Location of potential archeological resources is unknown.)   | Possible effects to potential archeological resources. Effects would depend on depth of excavation. (Location of potential archeological resources is unknown.)   | Possible effects to potential archeological resources. Effects would depend on depth of excavation. (Location of potential archeological resources is unknown.)  | Possible effects to potential archeological resources. Effects could depend on depth of excavation. (Location of potential archeological resources is unknown.)  | No foreseeable effects to<br>potential archeological resources<br>because excavation for pavilion is<br>expected to be minimal.  | Possible effects to potential archeological resources.     Effects would depend on depth of excavation. (Location of potential archeological resources is unknown.)  |

DRAFT Assessment of Adverse Effects Matrix

September 13, 2012

## **Washington Monument Screening Facility – Draft Assessment of Adverse Effects Matrix**

|  | Option A  | Option B  | Option C  | Option D  | Option E   | Option F  |
|--|---|-----------|---|-----------|--|---|
|  |   |           |   |           |  |   |
| Avoidance/ Minimization/ Mitigation  Section 106 Consulting Parties Comments | Avoidance  Avoids changes to physical fabric at Monument's east door.  Avoids changes to plaza.  Avoids blocking views of east door.  Minimization  Location of entrance below plaza level minimizes effects on views of Monument itself from east. | Avoidance | Avoidance  Avoids changes to physical fabric at Monument's east door.  Avoids changes to plaza.  Avoids blocking views of east door.  Minimization  Location of ramps to the north and south and entrance below plaza level minimizes effects on views of Monument itself from east.  Mitigation  Exposing the elevation obelisk would allow it to be viewed and interpreted. | Avoidance | <ul> <li>Avoidance         <ul> <li>Avoids changes to lawn and mound.</li> <li>Avoids removal of foundation material.</li> <li>Avoids changes to traditional circulation and allows access to original lobby.</li> <li>Avoids need for balanced unloading.</li> <li>Avoids changes to below-grade mechanical area on west.</li> <li>Avoids potential effects to archeological resources.</li> </ul> </li> <li>Minimization         <ul> <li>Minimizes changes to traditional circulation.</li> </ul> </li> </ul> | Avoidance  Avoids changes to physical fabric at Monument's east door.  Avoids changes to lawn and mound.  Avoids blocking views of east door.  Minimization  Minimization by locating ramp within existing plaza.  Minimizes effects on views of Monument itself by utilizing a single ramp within the plaza. |
|  |   |           |   |           |  |   |

DRAFT Assessment of Adverse Effects Matrix

September 13, 2012